Audit & Governance Committee 22 June 2015

Internal Audit – Implementation of Recommendations



Report of the Corporate Head, Financial Management

Ward(s) affected: All

- 1 <u>Purpose of Report</u> **To** update committee members on internal audit recommendations outstanding and report on those that were completed in the final quarter of 2014/15.
- 2 Recommendations Members are recommended to:
 - 2.1 Note the contents of *Appendix A Outstanding Internal Audit Recommendations* where the original target completion date was prior to June 2015 and consider inviting responsible officers to the next meeting where appropriate. Value for Money Clinics were held in May 2015 but no referrals were made.
 - 2.2 Note the contents of *Appendix B Audit Recommendations Completed in the Period* and approve the contents of that Appendix. Recommendations will not be archived before this approval is received together with that of the Principal Auditor, Shared Audit Service.

3 **Implications**

- 3.1 **Financial and Value for Money (vfm) Implications** as highlighted for individual recommendations in Internal Audit Reports
- 3.2 **Legal Implications** none
- 3.3 **Contribution to Council Priorities** not applicable
- 3.4 **Risk Management** as highlighted for individual recommendations in Internal Audit Reports
- 3.5 **Equality Analysis** Not applicable

4 Consultations with Others

CLT and Senior Managers/Action Owners

5 Access to Information: Background Documents None

6 Author of the Report

Rebecca Steel, Performance Management Officer

Telephone: 01756 706215 e-mail: rsteel@cravendc.gov.uk

Note: Members are invited to contact the author in advance of the meeting with any detailed queries or questions.

7 Appendices –

Appendix A – Outstanding Internal Audit Recommendations where the original target completion date was prior to June 2015

Appendix B – Audit Recommendations completed in the period

\/∆r	cınn	١N٥
v C1	SIUI	1110

AGENDA ITEM 5b

PAGE INTENTIONALLY BLANK

AGENDA ITEM 5b

Appendix A – Outstanding Internal Audit Recommendations where the original target completion date was prior to June 2015

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Status	Latest Update	Updated by	Date
Service Support (Dated Feb 09) - Priority 2 C2 06 -	Strategy ensuring that it is documented and appropriately held so as to enable access when	Oct 2009 C2		Amber	Currently on hold pending appointment of new post-holder.	CF	09/06/15
C2 07 - Data Handling - Priority 1 C5 08 - ICT Review of Outstanding Actions - Priority 1	IA 14/15 059 A strategy should be compiled as to the most appropriate way in which to carry out a Council wide review of all data sharing, and arrangements put in place to promptly address this to ensure compliance with the guidelines	C2 07 - Aug 2012 C5 08 - Mar 2015	Information Services	Amber	Rudimentary processes are in place. The Information Governance Project will enhance and formalise these.	CF	09/06/15
Handling - Priority 2 C5 08 - ICT Review of Outstanding	IA 14/15 044 Management should examine the current staffing structure and consider how the Senior Information Risk Owner and Information Asset Owner roles and responsibilities could be appropriately provided for		Information Services	Amber	The Information Governance Project incorporates these requirements. This project is now in its delivery phase. Once the SIRO process is in place then further updates will be provided.	CF	09/06/15
C2 07 - Data Handling - Priority 2 C5 08 - ICT Review of Outstanding Actions - Priority 2		C2 07 - Dec 2012 C5 08 - Dec 2015	Information Services	Amber	The IG project will address these issues by creating a process including ongoing staff training and monitoring.	CF	09/06/15

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Status	Latest Update	Updated by	Date
C4 03 - Sundry Debtors 2012/13 - Priority 3 C5 03 - Sundry Debtors 2014/15 - Priority 3	IA 14/15 135 The Fair Debt Collection Framework should be reviewed in terms of sundry debt recovery strategy.	C4 03 - Nov 2014 C5 03 - Sep 2015	Financial Management	Not started - not yet required	Revised timescales for implementation now agreed as part of recent audit. Framework will now be reviewed for approval in September at Policy Committee	СН	08/04/15
C4 06 - Data Security Standards - Priority 2	IA 14/15 150 The proposed installation of the excess card payment devices at other sites should be carried out as soon as possible	C4 06 - Oct 2014	Information Services (to be transferred to Financial Management)	Amber	Ownership of this recommendation is to be transferred from Information Services All sites requiring payment card devices now have them. Finance will now review the distribution and providers and review contracts as appropriate. IT will then be informed of the precise location of all devices in accordance with recommendation 146 below.	СН	11/06/15
C4 06 - Data Security Standards - Priority 3	IA 14/15 146 ICT Management should update their records to ensure that these reflect actual payment card hardware used Council wide	C4 06 - Jan 2015	Information Services	Amber	All sites requiring payment card devices now have them. Finance will now review the distribution and providers and review contracts as appropriate. IT will then be informed of the precise location of all devices in accordance with this recommendation.	СН	11/06/15
C4 08 - Data Protection - Priority 2	IA 14/15 154 Procedures should be expanded to include registering, indexing, classifying, security marking and tracking as part of the creation and maintenance of records.	C4 08 - Oct 2014	Information Services	Amber	This is a component of the Information Governance Project.	CF	09/06/15
C4 08 - Data Protection - Priority 2	IA 14/15 158 The Retention Guidelines and the Records Transfer, Retrieval and Disposal Procedures should be included in the documents made available on fileshare	C4 08 - Oct 2014	Information Services	Amber	This is included in the Information Governance Project.	CF	09/06/15

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Status	Latest Update	Updated by	Date
C4 08 - Data Protection - Priority 2	IA 14/15 159 Information risks notified to the Corporate Risk Management Group should also be reported to the SIRO	C4 08 - Oct 2014	Information Services	Amber	This is included within the scope of the Information Governance Project.	CF	09/06/15
C4 08 - Data Protection - Priority 2	IA 14/15 160 Staff should be made aware of the ICO's data sharing checklist contained within section 15 of the Data Sharing Code of Practice	C4 08 - Oct 2014	Information Services	(none)			
C4 08 - Data Protection 2013/14 - Priority 1 C5 08 - ICT Review of Outstanding Actions - Priority 1	IA 14/15 152 The electronic records and the EDRMS phases of the Information Management Project should be progressed	C4 08 - Aug 2014 C5 08 - Dec 2014	Information Services	Amber	An approved project plan is now in place. An Information Governance Officer is now in post and development is in progress.	CF	09/06/15
C4 08 - Data Protection 2013/14 - Priority 1 C5 08 - ICT Review of Outstanding Actions - Priority 1	IA 14/15 153 A Records Management Policy covering all formats, which is clearly owned at an appropriate level, should be produced, approved, appropriately communicated Council wide and training provided. Compliance with the Policy should be monitored	C4 08 - Aug 2014 C5 08 - Mar 2015	Information Services	Amber	This is being addressed by the Information Governance Project.	CF	09/06/15
C4 08 - Data Protection 2013/14 - Priority 1 C5 08 - ICT Review of Outstanding Actions - Priority 1	IA 14/15 157 A clearly owned information asset inventory should be developed and maintained. Once developed, identified information asset owners should ensure that risks and opportunities are monitored	C4 08 - Aug 2014 C5 08 - Apr/Sep 2015	Information Services	Amber	Data audits to document the Councils Information Assets form part of the Information Governance Project. Data audits are expected to take upwards of 6 months. The planning of Data audits is part of the Information Governance Officer role and is currently in progress.	CF	09/06/15

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Status	Latest Update	Updated by	Date
C4 09 - Council Tax and Non- Domestic Rates 2013/14 - Priority 2	IA 14/15 134 Arrangements should be made for the regular testing of the BCP	C4 09 - Nov 2014	Revenues & Benefits	Red	No progress due to changes in personnel within IT. SLT now getting training on Business Continuity and Emergency Planning and it seems a more corporate view will be taken.		23/04/15
C4 09 - Council Tax and Non- Domestic Rates 2013/14 - Priority 2	IA 14/15 131 All procedure notes relating to the recovery process should be made available electronically and centrally stored. Progress as to the documentation of a complete set of up to date procedure notes should continue.	C4 09 - Dec 2014	Revenues & Benefits	Amber	This is underway and requires constant review. We have a team leader starting in May 2015 and she will have responsibility for this	DD	23/04/15
C4 11 - Craven Pool Follow Up - Priority 3	IA 14/15 129 The signage around the town and especially that at the entrance to the site should be drastically improved so as to sell the site, especially to Pay As You Go Members or holidaymakers. Any cost incurred in making these improvements should be repaid through additional income generated from new members as a result.	C4 11 - No date specified	Craven Pool & Fitness Centre	Amber	An initial meeting with the College and the Academy has been held. New signage for the main entrance is being proposed. The project is being led by the college and costings are now being awaited.	LH	29/04/15
C4 12 - Members Expenses - Priority 2	IA 14/15 122 Craven District Council moves to using Trent for all mileage and subsistence claims, thereby ensuring that a) The declaration has to be signed otherwise the claim cannot be submitted b) All areas of the claim have to be completed. c) Claims can be completed on a daily basis and submitted at any time.	C4 12 - Not specified	Financial Management	Amber	The growth bid has been successful. Implementation to commence during later part of 2015/16. Project planning to commence in July, subject to other payroll projects.		08/04/15

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Status	Latest Update	Updated by	Date
C4 15 - Creditors - Priority 2 C5 14 - Creditors - Priority 2	IA 14/15 163 Manual distribution should be avoided where possible; however in those instances where it's unavoidable, care should be taken to ensure that it does not go back to the original Requisitioner. The workflow log and the workflow map should agree. Investigate workflow stages to ensure that the outcome on the workflow map matches to the outcome for the task action (i.e. where the workflow map show the last step to be abort, the action does not show approve, as testing has found it currently does)	C4 15 - Feb 2015 C5 14 - Feb 2015	Financial Management	Amber	Management considered this to be low risk given low error rate identified as part of audit. Some investigation has been undertaken to try and pin point problems more clearly and we are aware of the specific occurrence on 1 workflow. The system is to be upgraded in within the next six months and all workflows will be reviewed as a matter of course in preparation for the upgrade		08/04/15
C4 15 - Creditors - Priority 2 C5 14 - Creditors - Priority 2	IA 14/15 164 Where a requisition requires amendment, this workflow needs to be reviewed and amended to include an authorisation stage	C4 15 - Feb 2015 C5 14 - Feb 2015	Financial Management	Amber	Management considered this to be low risk given low error rate identified as part of audit. Some investigation has been undertaken to try and pin point problems more clearly and we are aware of the specific occurrence on 1 workflow. The system is to be upgraded in within the next six months and all workflows will be reviewed as a matter of course in preparation for the upgrade		08/04/15
C4 15 - Creditors - Priority 2 C5 14 - Creditors - Priority not specified	IA 14/15 168 All invoices should be addressed to the finance section in Belle Vue Square. Utility bills are by their nature less risky and more complex as such these can be omitted from the recommendation initially and review separately as they may require an alternative solution.		Financial Management	Amber	Many suppliers already address invoices to Accounts Payable (e.g. finance), Belle Vue Square as purchase orders state requirement to do this. Further review of process to take place as part of Agresso upgrade implementation during July/August as changes to the way invoices are processed in the system will mean a wider process review is required.	СН	08/04/15

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Status	Latest Update	Updated by	Date
C5 05 - Officer Expenses - Priority 2	IA 14/15 183 The form should have a declaration section whereby the claimant signs to declare that the journeys listed have been undertaken and that they have read the governing rules and that the journeys were authorised business journeys	C5 05 - Jan 2015	Financial Management	Amber	Review of forms is to be aligned with the work to review the expenses policy – see recommendation IA 14/15 180. Determined this will be more efficient approach	СН	08/04/15
	IA 14/15 184 Authorisers should be reminded of their responsibilities for the approval of claims	C5 05 - Jan 2015	Financial Management	Amber	Now aligned with the work to review the expenses policy which is underway— see recommendation IA 14/15 180. Determined this will be more efficient approach	СН	08/04/15
C5 05 - Officer Expenses - Priority 2	IA 14/15 185 Control systems should be updated to ensure liability is covered effectively. The form should include a signed declaration whereby the claimant declares that their licence is valid and that their insurance policy incorporates a clause indemnifying the Council against third party claims arising out of the use of vehicles on official business. Thus devolving responsibility to the car user.	C5 05 - Jan 2015	Financial Management	Amber	Now aligned with the work to review the expenses policy which is underway— see recommendation IA 14/15 180. Determined this will be more efficient approach	СН	08/04/15

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Status	Latest Update	Updated by	Date
C5 05 - Officer Expenses - Priority 2	IA 14/15 176 Update the requirements stipulated in the policy with regards to registration documents	C5 05 - Mar 2015	Financial Management	Amber	The Policy has been reviewed and updated by the VFM and Improvement Manager in draft form for discussion with and approval by appropriate officers. The policy document and claims forms include both Member and staff travel and subsistence claims. The final documents will be produced and circulated once Policy Committee have considered the report of the Independent Remuneration Panel relating to Member remuneration/expenses to avoid duplication of effort.	СН	11/06/15
C5 05 - Officer Expenses - Priority 2	IA 14/15 180 A slight amendment is required to the policy to include a requirement for journey start and end destinations.	C5 05 - Mar 2015	Financial Management	Amber	The Policy has been reviewed and updated by the VFM and Improvement Manager in draft form for discussion with and approval by appropriate officers. The policy document and claims forms include both Member and staff travel and subsistence claims. The final documents will be produced and circulated once Policy Committee have considered the report of the Independent Remuneration Panel relating to Member remuneration/expenses to avoid duplication of effort.	СН	11/06/15
C5 07 - CDC Parking Management & Civil Parking Enforcement Arrangements since December 2013 - Priority 2	IA 14/15 195 Car park income performance should be reported to Senior Management and Members on a quarterly basis	C5 07 - Mar 2015	Assets & Projects	Amber	Reporting template has been designed and agreed. Next steps to agree with CLT format for sharing with CLT team and fit with financial reports to Policy Committee.	HS	22/4/15

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Status	Latest Update	Updated by	Date
C5 07 - CDC Parking Management & Civil Parking Enforcement Arrangements since December 2013 - Priority 2	IA 14/15 197 A list of car park machine key holders should be maintained. If possible a list should obtained from G4S	C5 07 - Apr 2015	Assets & Projects	Amber	Task begun and action ongoing.	HS	09/04/15
C5 07 - CDC Parking Management & Civil Parking Enforcement Arrangements since December 2013 - Priority 1	IA 14/15 194 Procedure notes and Performance Monitoring should be strengthened	C5 07 - May 2015	Assets & Projects	Amber	Reporting of income by car park now being undertaken by Parking Services Officer and sent to cashiers to allocate into accounts. Parking income reporting format agreed and ready to feed into CLT & Member reports as necessary - reporting frequency to be agreed with CLT. Cash collection performance monitoring spreadsheet set up and being populated by Parking Officer. Parking service operational procedure notes being drafted by Parking Officer.		09/04/15

AGENDA ITEM 5b

Appendix B – Audit Recommendations Completed in the Period

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Latest Update	Action Updater
C3 03 - Sundry Debtors - Priority 2 C4 03 - Sundry Debtors - Priority 2 C5 03 - Sundry Debtors - Priority 2	IA 14/15 084 The Agresso legal debt recovery module should be implemented subject to available resources	C3 03 - Nov 2013 C4 03 - Nov 2014 C5 03 - not stated	Financial Management	Following further discussion with the Council's Monitoring Officer, Solicitor and Strategic Manager Finance, it has been decided not to progress with implementation of legal debt recovery. HM Courts have now introduced Money Claims Online and are in discussion regarding its further expansion as the preferred route for such clams in line with the government's information/transformation of services strategy. It has been decided that moving to use the government system would be the most cost effective and efficient option for administration of claims going forward. Further implementation costs and ongoing software support costs will be saved by the Council as a result of not progressing with the implementation into live system status.	Claire Hudson
C3 05 - IS Data Handling (Members) - Priority 1 C5 08 - ICT Review of Outstanding Actions - Priority 1	responsibility document to be		Information Services	All Members with I-Pads have now signed the acceptable usage forms.	Chris Firth
Priority 2 C5 08 - ICT	IA 14/15 109 Consider options available for workload coverage in the absence of the Technical Analyst/Applications & Development	C3 06 - Nov 2013 C5 08 - Dec 2014	Information Services	Risk has been reduced by purchasing outside back-up technical support.	Chris Firth
C4 02 - Contract Management - Priority 2	IA 14/15 112 The VAT numbers for new suppliers set up between November 2011 and September 2013 should be verified on the HMRC website.	C4 02 - Jun 2014	Financial Management	Review undertaken by the Finance Apprentice and data now uploaded into Agresso. VAT numbers are now gathered routinely when adding new suppliers. Process of annual gap check and update to be put in place going forward	Claire Hudson
C4 06 - Data Security Standards - Priority 2	IA 14/15 147 Management should ensure that signed agreement to any change to a contract is obtained by both parties and is appropriately retained	C4 06 - Oct 2014	Information Services	Contracts of value £100K are sealed and retained in the deeds file. Lessor contracts are retained by the relevant manager. ICT scan and store their contracts on the Manage Engine System.	Chris Firth

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Latest Update	Action Updater
C4 06 - Data Security Standards - Priority 2	IA 14/15 148 Management should ensure proper contract ownership and safekeeping	C4 06 - Oct 2014	Information Services	Contracts of value £100K are sealed and retained in the deeds file. Lessor contracts are retained by the relevant manager. ICT scan and store their contacts on the Manage Engine System.	Chris Firth
C4 06 - Data Security Standards - Priority 3	IA 14/15 151 Evidence of Civica's compliance with the PCI standard should be obtained in the form of an Attestation of Compliance and continuity arrangements implemented to ensure evidence is obtained annually	C4 06 - Jan 2015	Information Services	This task will be logged as an annual routine task	Chris Firth
C4 06 - Payment Card Industry - Data Security Standard - Priority 1 C5 08 - ICT Review of Outstanding Actions - Priority 1	IA 14/15 149 The outstanding PCI DSS self-assessment questionnaire should be completed, submitted and contingency arrangements put in place to ensure that SAQ A is carried out each year before compliance expiry		Information Services	Further self-assessment not required. We have received confirmation from the merchant bank provider that the Council took necessary steps to achieve compliancy in November 2014. A compliance certificate has been received which covers all merchant IDs in use by the Council through to November 2015. Further online submission will be required in November 2015.	Chris Firth
C4 11 - Craven Pool Follow Up - Priority 2	IA 14/15 126 Investigate whether the day passes can be restricted to 1 day only. If this is not possible, introduce a control whereby the Gym Duty Officer has to remove the card from the non-member before they leave	C4 11 - Jul 2013		One day passes have now been introduced using the software system.	Lloyd Hancox
C4 14 - Housing Benefits - Priority 2	IA 14/15 140 Redesign the Benefit Assessment Sheet	C4 14 - Sep 2014	Revenues & Benefits	Complete	Deborah Davies
C4 16 - Treasury Management - Priority 2 C5 09 - Treasury Management	IA 14/15 145 An up-to-date listing of staff authorised to make deals on behalf of the Council should be created and distributed	C4 16 - Aug 2014 C5 09 - Sep 2014	Financial Management	An updated list has now been provided to relevant institutions.	Nicola Chick
C5 02 - Creditor Spend Review 2013 14 - Priority 2	IA 14/15 186 Management should address the gap in procurement for the member of workshop agency staff appointed out of contract	C5 02 - Jun 2015	Waste Management	All required personnel are now managed under one agency contract.	Paul Florentine

Source Report	Recommendation Name	Original Target Date	Service Area	Latest Update	Action Updater
Review 2013 14 - Priority	IA 14/15 188 A procurement process should be completed for the spend area 'refuse vehicle parts'	C5 02 - Jun 2015	Waste Management	The procurement process has been undertaken.	Paul Florentine
C5 02 - Creditor Spend Review 2013 14 - Priority 2	IA 14/15 192 The format of the general and IT contract registers should be the same and be consistently completed	C5 02 - Jun 2015	Financial Management	The format of the general and IT contract registers have now been aligned	Claire Hudson
C5 05 - Officer Expenses	IA 14/15 182 The preparation of the VAT journal needs to be reviewed so that it only includes those claims where a VAT receipt exists	C5 05 - Mar 2015	Financial Management	The VAT journal has been amended to only include mileage claims where a VAT receipt has been received. The revised system has been in place for a few months and no problems have been encountered.	Anne Hainsworth
Parking Enforcement Arrangements since	IA 14/15 193 Parking Services should be more accountable for the income generated and therefore should reconcile income to Agresso	C5 07 - Feb 2015	Assets & Projects	Quality of information provided by cash collection contractor is improving together with modernisation of machine software being rolled out to all machines capable of accommodating to provide more comprehensive data is allowing for reconciliation of income to Agresso to be improved. These reconciliations are now being done each month.	Hazel Smith
Management & Civil Parking Enforcement Arrangements since	IA 14/15 196 The temporary Parking Officer needs to ensure that the final maintenance invoice up to 30th September 2014 includes a deduction for the maintenance that has been overpaid	C5 07 - Apr 2015	Assets & Projects	Done and action completed.	Hazel Smith
C5 13 - Review of Motor Workshop, Engine Shed Lane, Skipton - Priority 2	IA 14/15 202 External Work - The Council's website should be updated on the MOT section to give the Workshop contact number to book MOT tests and to update the information which is now out of date.	C5 13 - Mar 2015	Waste Management	The CDC website has now been updated with updated information.	Paul Florentine
C5 13 - Review of Motor Workshop, Engine Shed Lane, Skipton - Priority 2	IA 14/15 203 External Work - Consideration should be given to setting up a shared electronic calendar between Licensing and the Workshop	C5 13 - Jul 2015	Waste Management	This is now in place ensuring no 'double booking' occurs.	Paul Florentine

Source Report	Recommendation Name		Service Area	Latest Update	Action Updater
Workshop, Engine Shed Lane, Skipton - Priority 2	IA 14/15 207 Income and Expenditure - Given the current objectives and services provided by the Workshop, appropriate budget provision needs to be made for the Apprentice and Agency member of staff.	C5 13 - Mar 2015	Financial Management	The workshop salary budgets for 2015/16 include appropriate budget provision for the apprentice and for ad hoc assistance through either temporary employees or agency.	Nicola Chick
Workshop, Engine Shed	IA 14/15 208 Income and Expenditure - On taxi MOTs, an appropriate charge needs to be made to Licensing with a credit to the Workshop account so that the Workshop receives the benefit of the income received.	(5 3 - Mar /015	Financial Management	The recharge to licensing is now being done on a regular basis as part of the quarterly recharges.	Nicola Chick
Workshop Engine Shed	IA 14/15 209 Income and Expenditure - The hourly rate for recharges to services needs to be increased to recover the net cost of the Workshop over the relevant services	C5 13 - Mar 2015	Financial Management	The recharge to services has been reviewed to ensure that appropriate costs are recovered. The costs associated with private work are calculated to cover the costs of the mechanic time and contribute to the fixed costs of the workshop. This should generate a small surplus on the workshop account - dependent on volume of work. The account is always reviewed at the year end.	Nicola Chick